

EVIDENCE REVIEW SHEET

George MacDonald - review of "George Macdonald - File 1 (2).pdf"

Applicant / subject	George Carlaw Wright MacDonald / Macdonald
Date of birth	25 February 1960
File reviewed	George Macdonald - File 1 (2).pdf (8 PDF pages)
Strongest evidence	Identity and 1976-77 detention/custodial history, particularly Glenochil, with references to Longriggend and Barlinnie.
Core evidential limitation	The file does not itself establish residence in a children's home, residential school, foster placement, assessment centre or other clearly Redress-eligible care setting. No direct evidence of abuse is recorded in these eight pages.

Category Review

Category	PDF page(s)	Evidence / finding	Classification	Relevance / note
1. Proof of placement and eligibility	1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 8	Identity: full name recorded as George Carlaw Wright MacDonald/Macdonald; DOB 25/02/1960. Page 8 records a 3-month detention ordered on 06/12/1976. Pages 1, 6 and 7 repeat a 3-month detention/Glenochil history. Pages 2 and 5 refer to Longriggend, Barlinnie and "2 months Glen Ochil". Page 6 records release from Glenochil and one year of after-care.	Direct official evidence (p.8) plus corroborative social work/application records.	Useful for custodial history. Exact admission/discharge and transfer dates are not given. Eligibility as a Redress care setting is not established by this file alone.
2. Direct evidence of physical abuse	3, 4, 6	No direct physical abuse of George identified. Pages 3-4 contain a prospective-carer discussion referring to managing behaviour by "sanctions or physical"; page 6 says the couple did not believe in physical chastisement.	Context only - not evidence of abuse of George.	Do not present the prospective-carer wording as an assault disclosure.
3. Direct evidence of sexual abuse	None	No reference identified to rape, indecent/sexual assault, inappropriate touching, grooming, forced nudity, sexual misconduct, exploitation or related disclosure.	No evidence found.	No sexual-abuse evidence in this file.
4. Emotional / psychological abuse	3, 4	No direct evidence identified. A statement about "killing me in my bed with a knife" appears in a hypothetical discussion of severe bad behaviour, not as a disclosure of treatment experienced by George.	Context only.	Should not be characterised as an abuse disclosure.
5. Neglect	None	No evidence identified of inadequate food, clothing, accommodation, heating, hygiene, medical care, education, supervision, emotional care or safeguarding failures affecting George.	No evidence found.	No neglect evidence in this file.
6. Contemporaneous disclosures / complaints	None	No occasion identified where George reported abuse to social work, police, medical staff, family, teachers, residential staff or a Children's Hearing.	No evidence found.	No complaint or disclosure record located.
7. Institutional knowledge / failure to act	None	No records of complaints against staff, similar allegations by other children, disciplinary action, staff transfers, police/regulatory investigations, inspection concerns or safeguarding failures.	No evidence found.	No institutional-failure evidence in these pages.

Category	PDF page(s)	Evidence / finding	Classification	Relevance / note
8. Frequency, duration and pattern	1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 8	No abuse pattern can be established. Custody pattern shows a 3-month detention sentence in December 1976; social work records later refer to Glenochil and to Longriggend/Barlinnie. One-year after-care is recorded following release.	Corroborative custody chronology.	Duration discrepancy requires clarification: 3-month sentence vs "2 months Glen Ochil".
9. Mental-health / psychological impact	6	No anxiety, depression, PTSD, nightmares, flashbacks, self-harm, suicidal ideation, psychiatric admission, counselling or psychiatric medication identified. Page 6 states there did not appear to be health problems with the couple in the fostering assessment context.	No positive impact evidence.	This file does not document psychological harm linked to childhood experiences.
10. Physical / medical consequences	1	No injury or long-term physical consequence from abuse identified. Page 1 records George as medically acceptable in March 1992.	Medical context only.	No assault-related treatment or injury record.
11. Substance use / coping	1, 6	Page 1 records smoking no more than 8 cigarettes a day. Page 6 records that George described smoking as an addiction to nicotine.	Impact/context only.	No evidence links nicotine use to abuse, detention or trauma; no alcohol or illicit-drug misuse identified.
12. Education, relationships and life impact	6	Adult context includes marriage to Linda, two children, a good relationship with his children, employment as a nightshift despatch worker at Mathiesons the Bakers in Falkirk, and interest in future college attendance. A period of involvement with the Unification Church after Glenochil is also noted.	Background/context evidence.	No causal link to abuse is recorded.
13. Apparently contradictory / inconsistent evidence	1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 8	Pages 2 and 5 say George "Accepted what happened to him - good experience". Duration differs between 3 months (pp.1, 6, 7, 8) and "2 months Glen Ochil" (pp.2, 5). Name spelling varies between MacDonald/Macdonald/McDonald. Fostering records also contain differing wording concerning physical chastisement.	Contradictory / discrepancy evidence.	These matters should be addressed expressly if the eventual application alleges abuse in the named custodial settings.
14. Page-reference schedule	1-8	See detailed schedule on following page.	Reference schedule.	Records PDF page and internal page where available.

Custody / Placement Chronology

Date / period	Setting / event	Evidence	PDF page	Evidential status
6 Dec 1976	Falkirk Sheriff - road traffic / joy-riding-related offence	Three months detention ordered; 12-month disqualification.	8	Direct official legal disposal
1976-77	Glenochil	Three-month detention/Glenochil history repeated in later social work/application records.	1, 6, 7	Corroborative
Undated historical account	Longriggend / Barlinnie / Glenochil	Record refers to Longriggend, Barlinnie and "2 months Glen Ochil" in connection with joy riding.	2, 5	Corroborative; duration discrepancy
Following release	After-care	One year of after-care recorded following Glenochil; record also states "After his release from Glenochil".	6	Strong corroboration of actual custody/release
20 Sep 1977	Falkirk Sheriff	Theft; fine of GBP20.	8	Direct official legal record

Key Discrepancies / Points Requiring Follow-up

- **Duration:** pages 1, 6, 7 and 8 support a three-month detention/sentence, while pages 2 and 5 say "2 months Glen Ochil". The record does not explain whether time at Longriggend or Barlinnie accounts for the difference.
- **Name spelling:** MacDonald / Macdonald / McDonald variants appear. The DOB and full-name information strongly indicate the same person, but the variation should be preserved in requests and statements.
- **Positive description:** pages 2 and 5 record "Accepted what happened to him - good experience". If abuse is later alleged at Glenochil, Longriggend or Barlinnie, the context of this remark should be addressed rather than omitted.
- **Eligibility:** this file establishes custody/detention history, not a clearly eligible residential care placement for Scottish Redress. Eligibility must be established from the scheme rules and/or further institutional records.

Detailed Page-Reference Schedule

PDF page	Internal page	Date	Author / source	Relevant entry	Evidence type
1	6	Jul 1991 / Mar 1992	Alison Simpson, Social Worker	Dec 1976 and Sep 1977 offences; spent 3 months in detention. Later medically acceptable; smoking no more than 8/day.	Corroborative custody; medical/substance context
2	2	16 Mar 1992	Alison Simpson	Longriggend, Barlinnie, "2 months Glen Ochil"; joy riding; "good experience".	Corroborative + potential contradiction
3	1	31 Jan / 28 Feb 1992	Alison Simpson	Cross-reference to George's detailed contact record. Prospective-carer discussion includes "sanctions or physical" and hypothetical knife wording.	Context only; not abuse evidence
4	1	28 Feb 1992	Alison Simpson	Duplicate/continuation of page 3 material.	Duplicate/context
5	2	16 Mar 1992	Alison Simpson	Duplicate Longriggend/Barlinnie/Glenochil history.	Duplicate corroboration

PDF page	Internal page	Date	Author / source	Relevant entry	Evidence type
6	-	19 Mar 1991	Detailed Case Notes	Prior Social Enquiry Report; joy riding; sentenced to 3 months at Glenochil; 1 year after-care; "After his release from Glenochil"; adult family/employment context.	Strong corroborative custody/release evidence
7	-	15 Jul 1991	Central Regional Council application form	MacDonald; George Carlaw Wright; DOB 25/02/60; "Joy Riding, 3 months in Glenochill".	Direct identity + corroborative custody
8	1	6 Dec 1976 / 20 Sep 1977	Official conviction record	MACDONALD/GEORGE/CARLAW/WRIGHT; DOB 25/02/60; 3 months detention; later theft fine GBP20.	Direct official identity and legal-disposal evidence

Suggested Further Evidence Requests

- Original 1976-77 Social Enquiry Report and historical social work file referred to on PDF page 6.
- Glenochil admission, detention, transfer, release and after-care records.
- Longriggend and Barlinnie admission/transfer records to clarify the route and duration of custody.
- Falkirk Sheriff records underlying the 6 December 1976 disposal and 20 September 1977 conviction.

Review note: This sheet records what is evidenced in the reviewed 8-page file. Absence of evidence in this file should not be treated as proof that an event did not occur.