

# Evidence Extraction Sheet

Scottish borders 1.pdf | 23-page Borders Regional Council social-work bundle

**Important evidential distinction:** the bundle strongly proves care placements and contains repeated professional concern about excessive/physically abusive **parental** discipline. It does **not** directly record physical or sexual abuse by Priory/assessment-centre staff. A medical report during the Priory placement records an orbital contusion/bruising described as probably from a blow, but does not identify who caused it or the circumstances.

## Highlight colour key

| Colour | Meaning                                        |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|
| Yellow | Placement / legal basis / leave                |
| Orange | Physical injury / physical-abuse context       |
| Blue   | Emotional / psychological impact               |
| Green  | Medical / physical consequence                 |
| Pink   | Positive, contradictory or cautionary evidence |
| Teal   | Education / school evidence                    |

## Category findings

|                                              |                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|----------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. Proof of placement and eligibility        | FOUND - STRONG                      | Full name and DOB; Priory Children's Home, Selkirk; Regional Assessment Centre, Howdenhall/Liberton; admission/transfer dates; home leave; Children's Hearing, place of safety order, Residential/Compulsory Supervision, Sheriff appeal; Borders Regional Council Social Work involvement; staff and school/medical corroboration. |
| 2. Direct evidence of physical abuse         | PARTIAL / CONTEXTUAL                | Repeated records of excessive/physically abusive parental discipline that led to the 1980 placement. This is not recorded as abuse by Priory staff. A medical report while resident at the Priory records an orbital contusion/bruising described as probably from a blow, but no perpetrator or circumstances are identified.      |
| 3. Direct evidence of sexual abuse           | NOT FOUND                           | No reference to rape, sexual assault, inappropriate touching, forced nudity, sexualised conduct, sexual complaints, or sexual misconduct was identified in this 23-page file.                                                                                                                                                       |
| 4. Emotional / psychological abuse or impact | IMPACT FOUND; ABUSE NOT ESTABLISHED | Craig is recorded as unhappy about separation, initially going to his room alone and crying, making frequent upsetting calls home, and on one interpretation being frightened about returning home. The record expressly says no firm conclusion was reached about that interpretation.                                             |
| 5. Neglect                                   | NOT FOUND                           | No direct evidence of inadequate food, clothing, hygiene, accommodation, medical neglect, educational neglect, or safeguarding neglect by the care settings was identified.                                                                                                                                                         |

|                                             |                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|---------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 6. Contemporaneous disclosures / complaints | NO INSTITUTIONAL ABUSE DISCLOSURE FOUND | No recorded complaint by Craig alleging abuse by Priory or assessment-centre staff was identified. The file contains professional concerns about parental physical punishment.                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 7. Institutional knowledge / failure to act | NOT FOUND                               | No prior complaints against care staff, disciplinary investigations, regulatory findings, or failure-to-protect records concerning the Priory or Regional Assessment Centre were identified.                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 8. Frequency / duration / pattern           | PLACEMENT PATTERN FOUND                 | Residence and home-leave patterns are well documented. Parental physical punishment is referenced repeatedly across reports/reviews, but the file does not quantify a recurring pattern of abuse within the institution.                                                                                                                                                                |
| 9. Mental-health / psychological impact     | LIMITED                                 | Crying, upset, unhappiness and possible fear are documented. A medical report records no mental abnormality or emotional instability at that examination.                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 10. Physical / medical consequences         | FOUND - CAUTIOUS                        | Medical report records orbital contusion/bruising described as probably from a blow. No perpetrator is named and the scan does not establish that the injury was inflicted by institutional staff or another resident.                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 11. Substance use / coping                  | FOUND - NO TRAUMA LINK                  | The December 1981 pre-admission report records theft of alcohol and offences while under the influence of a large quantity of alcohol. No link to abuse/trauma is stated.                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 12. Education / relationships / life impact | FOUND                                   | Records show truancy/offending before care, transfer to Selkirk High School, generally good attendance/progress while at the Priory, and re-enrolment at Galashiels Academy during trial home placement.                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 13. Apparently contradictory evidence       | FOUND                                   | Positive descriptions include settled/highly satisfactory behaviour, good school attendance and satisfactory medical placement. There is also a one-day discrepancy in the Regional Assessment Centre transfer date (20 vs 21 January 1982), and the second Priory admission is recorded as 6 January 1982 although other wording refers to a return following the 21 December hearing. |

## 14. Page-reference schedule

Each row records the PDF page, internal page where visible, date, author/role, care setting, evidence category, factual extraction, relevance, evidential character and legibility/format.

| PDF p. | Internal p. | Date                       | Author / role                                                    | Care setting                                             | Category                                      | Short factual extract                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Relevance                                                                         | Evidence type         | Format                                            |
|--------|-------------|----------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------|---------------------------------------------------|
| 1      | -           | 16/18 Jul 1980             | Children's Hearing / Borders Region                              | The Priory Children's Home, Selkirk                      | Placement / legal basis                       | Supervision requirement requires Craig Walter Mein to reside at The Priory and be supervised by Borders Region Social Work Department; residential rules and manager-authorised leave apply.                                                                         | Strong proof of authorised residential placement before 1 Dec 2004.               | Direct documentary    | Typed form + handwriting; partly unclear/redacted |
| 2      | -           | 27 Jan 1982                | Gerry Parkinson, Social Worker (report signed p3)                | Regional Assessment Centre, Howdenhall, Liberton; Priory | Placement / transfer                          | Craig Walter Mein, DOB 26.06.67. Emergency transfer from Priory to Regional Assessment Centre on 21 Jan 1982 under Section 44(6). Priory admission stated as 6 Jan 1982.                                                                                             | Identity, care settings, dates, transfer and legal basis.                         | Direct documentary    | Typed; some redaction                             |
| 3      | 2           | 15-18/21 Jan 1982          | Gerry Parkinson, Social Worker                                   | Priory / Regional Assessment Centre                      | Leave / transfer                              | Home leave Friday 15 Jan to Sunday 17 Jan; returned to Priory on time the following day; then transferred to Regional Assessment Centre because Priory freedom was considered inappropriate in light of offending.                                                   | Leave/return pattern and reason for transfer.                                     | Direct documentary    | Typed; heavily redacted                           |
| 4      | -           | 21 Jan 1982                | Borders Regional Council Social Work memo; J. Moutrie role shown | Priory / Regional Assessment Centre                      | Placement / dates / safeguarding              | States care at Priory 20/6/80-17/2/81 under Compulsory Supervision Order; home on supervision 17/2/81-21/12/81; returned to Priory; transferred to Regional Assessment Centre on 20/1/82. Name remained on At Risk Register.                                         | Strong care chronology; notes date discrepancy with p2.                           | Direct documentary    | Typed                                             |
| 5      | -           | 16 Dec 1981                | John Dalrymple, Social Worker                                    | Priory                                                   | Reason for placement / physical-abuse context | Records poor parenting/anxiety-provoking family experiences and often excessive disciplining; 1980 emergency Priory admission confirmed by Children's Hearing; proposes new Priory placement.                                                                        | Reason for original placement and professional concern about parental discipline. | Corroborative/context | Typed; substantial redaction                      |
| 6      | -           | 21 Dec 1981 (stamp 22 Dec) | Children's Hearing                                               | Priory                                                   | Legal basis / admission                       | Supervision requirement varies existing requirement and requires Craig Walter Mein to reside in The Priory Children's Home, Selkirk from 6 Jan 1982, under a nominated social worker.                                                                                | Strong legal proof of second Priory placement.                                    | Direct documentary    | Typed form + handwriting; signatures redacted     |
| 7      | -           | 3 Dec 1981                 | John Dalrymple, Social Worker                                    | Priory                                                   | Reason / legal history / education            | Again records excessive parental disciplining, emergency admission, Children's Hearing confirmation and Sheriff appeal; recommends Priory rather than List D school; Selkirk High School proposed.                                                                   | Placement rationale and legal history.                                            | Corroborative/direct  | Typed; some redaction                             |
| 8      | 2           | 3 Dec 1981                 | John Dalrymple, Social Worker                                    | Priory                                                   | Placement planning                            | Children's Hearing arranged for 21 Dec; residential placement needed and availability at Priory to be established.                                                                                                                                                   | Pre-placement planning and authorisation trail.                                   | Corroborative         | Typed                                             |
| 9      | -           | 17 Feb 1981 report         | Borders Regional Council Social Work Department                  | Priory                                                   | Identity / legal basis / residence / leave    | DOB 26.06.67; Residential Supervision Requirement under Section 44(1)(h), made 16 Jul 1980 after place of safety order on 20 Jun and 21-day detention ordered 26 Jun; Sheriff upheld on 19 Aug; resident at Priory since 20 Jun except weekends/holidays/trial home. | Core proof of placement and legal basis.                                          | Direct documentary    | Typed                                             |
| 9      | -           | 1980-81                    | Same                                                             | Priory / Selkirk High School                             | Contradictory/positive evidence               | Behaviour in Priory described as highly satisfactory; school attendance very good; no further offences during stay.                                                                                                                                                  | Positive evidence that should be addressed rather than omitted.                   | Adverse/contradictory | Typed                                             |

| PDF p. | Internal p. | Date                                          | Author / role                                          | Care setting           | Category                                | Short factual extract                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Relevance                                                                                                      | Evidence type             | Format                                   |
|--------|-------------|-----------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------------------|
| 10     | 2           | 1980 history                                  | John Dalrymple report continuation                     | Home / reason for care | Physical-abuse context                  | Social Work view that parental discipline was excessive; place of safety order on 20 Jun 1980; previous acknowledgement of going over the score in early 1980; concern about future excessive discipline.                               | Explains safeguarding reason for care, but not institutional abuse.                                            | Corroborative/context     | Typed; names/actions partly redacted     |
| 11     | 3           | 26 Jan-17 Feb 1981                            | John Dalrymple, Social Worker                          | Trial home placement   | Discharge / supervision                 | After child-care reviews Craig lived at home on trial from 26 Jan; department recommended return home under Compulsory Supervision with fortnightly social-work visits.                                                                 | Temporary leave/trial and discharge planning.                                                                  | Direct documentary        | Typed; one line partly redacted          |
| 12     | -           | 14 Jan 1981                                   | John Dalrymple, Social Worker to Children's Reporter   | Priory / home          | Residence / trial leave                 | States Craig was admitted to Priory the previous summer and remained there; asks for residential supervision review and proposes approx. 3-week trial living at home and attending Galashiels Academy.                                  | Continued residence and planned transition.                                                                    | Direct documentary        | Typed/scan quality poor                  |
| 13     | -           | 7/12 Jan 1981                                 | John Dalrymple, Social Worker; review attendees        | Priory                 | Staff / physical-abuse context / leave  | Attendees include Karen Mackie (Second Officer), John Dalrymple, Craig; Mr Mason (Officer in Charge) noted. Review refers to risk of further physically abusive behaviour by father and plans trial return home 23 Jan / school 26 Jan. | Names staff and records safeguarding concern plus planned leave.                                               | Corroborative/context     | Typed                                    |
| 14     | -           | 8 Jan 1981                                    | John Dalrymple, Social Worker                          | Priory                 | Review / leave / positive evidence      | Craig described as settled in Priory with good Selkirk High attendance; enjoyed extended home period over Christmas/New Year.                                                                                                           | Review confirms continued residence and home leave; also positive evidence.                                    | Direct/contradictory      | Typed; redaction                         |
| 15     | 2           | 8 Jan 1981                                    | John Dalrymple, Social Worker                          | Priory / home          | Psychological impact                    | One possible explanation for behaviour deterioration was that Craig was frightened at the prospect of returning home; record says no firm conclusion was reached.                                                                       | Possible fear/psychological impact, expressly uncertain.                                                       | Impact/corroborative      | Typed                                    |
| 16     | -           | 7 Nov 1980                                    | W. Calder, Area Team Leader; multi-disciplinary review | Priory                 | Staff / review / physical-abuse context | Attendees: John Dalrymple, K. Mackie, J. Robertson, A. Torrance, Craig, W. Calder. Father is recorded as having difficulty accepting that physical punishment of Craig was a problem.                                                   | Institutional review record and reason care could not yet end.                                                 | Corroborative/context     | Typed                                    |
| 17     | 2           | Nov-Dec 1980                                  | W. Calder, Area Team Leader                            | Priory / home          | Leave pattern                           | Weekend contact increased: leave Friday after school, return Sunday evening; proposed Christmas block 19-28 Dec 1980.                                                                                                                   | Detailed temporary leave dates/pattern.                                                                        | Direct documentary        | Typed                                    |
| 18     | -           | Medical exam, 1980 (date handwriting unclear) | Dr R. Elliott (handwriting)                            | Priory, Selkirk        | Medical / physical consequence          | Medical Report on Child in Care names Craig Walter Mein and Priory, Selkirk. Handwritten examination note appears to record an orbital contusion/bruising and says it was probably from a blow.                                         | Medical confirmation of residence and contemporaneous injury; no perpetrator/circumstances stated.             | Direct medical / cautious | Typed form + handwriting                 |
| 19     | -           | 1980 continuation                             | Dr R. Elliott / Borders Health Board                   | Priory                 | Medical / mental-health / contradictory | No history of fits; no mental abnormality/emotional instability; no medication/treatment. General health note again refers to orbital injury. The form indicates suitable/satisfactory placement on medical grounds.                    | Physical injury evidence plus positive medical findings that may appear inconsistent with broader allegations. | Direct medical / adverse  | Typed form + handwriting; partly unclear |
| 20     | -           | 5 Sep 1980                                    | W. Calder, Area Team Leader; care review               | Priory                 | Staff / emotional impact / leave        | Review attendees include Thomson Mason, Karen Mackie, John Dalrymple. Craig is described as unhappy about separation and anxious to maintain family contact. Weekend leave from Sat 8.30am to Sun 6.30pm approved.                      | Emotional impact and detailed home leave/contact.                                                              | Impact/direct documentary | Typed                                    |

| PDF p. | Internal p. | Date                               | Author / role                               | Care setting                           | Category                                 | Short factual extract                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Relevance                                                                           | Evidence type               | Format                               |
|--------|-------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| 21     | 2           | 10 Sep 1980                        | W. Calder, Area Team Leader                 | Priory                                 | Review continuation                      | Records next review date as 7 Nov 1980.                                                                                                                                                                                          | Confirms ongoing review process.                                                    | Corroborative               | Typed                                |
| 22     | -           | Admission 20 Jun 1980; report 1980 | T. Mason, Officer in Charge / Priory report | Priory, Ettrick Road, Selkirk, TD7 5AJ | Residence / emotional impact / education | Report gives Priory address and date of admission 20.6.1980. Initially Craig went to his room alone and cried; frequent phone calls home upset him/parents. Transfer to Selkirk High; visits home one evening and a weekend day. | Strong residence evidence, address, emotional impact and education/contact pattern. | Direct documentary / impact | Typed; spelling variation Craig Mien |
| 23     | continued   | 1980                               | Priory report continuation                  | Priory                                 | Education / staff / positive evidence    | Positive signs include regular school attendance and non-delinquent behaviour; notes a change of Social Worker.                                                                                                                  | Education impact and staff continuity; positive evidence.                           | Corroborative/adverse       | Typed                                |

## Key discrepancies / cautions

- Regional Assessment Centre transfer date: page 4 states 20 January 1982; pages 2-3 describe emergency transfer on 21 January 1982. Treat this as a one-day documentary discrepancy.
- Second Priory placement: the 21 December 1981 supervision form states residence at the Priory from 6 January 1982. Page 2 also states admission on 6 January. Page 4 more generally says he returned to Priory care following the 21 December hearing; it does not give a conflicting admission date.
- Medical injury: the handwritten medical wording is partly unclear but appears to record an orbital contusion/bruising and the phrase "probably from a blow." The record does not identify a perpetrator, location of incident, witness, explanation, treatment, or whether it was repeated. It should not be presented as proof that Priory staff caused the injury.
- Positive evidence: several records describe Craig as settled, polite/helpful, attending school well, or medically satisfactorily placed. Those observations do not disprove unrecorded abuse, but they are evidence that appears inconsistent with an assertion that the records themselves document ongoing institutional mistreatment.
- Redactions: several pages contain substantial black redactions. No attempt has been made to infer the hidden wording.